

COMMUNITIES AND INDUSTRIES FORUM (CIF)

A forum for communication between industry and the community -all welcome

Minutes of the Meeting held on Tuesday 4 October 2011
5.30 pm – 7.30 pm at the Kwinana Recquatic, Gilmore Avenue, Kwinana

PRESENT

Don	Allanach	Homestead Ridge Progress Association
Karen	Boyce	Tiwest
Richard	Cade	Wellard Resident
Erin	Davey	BP Refinery
John	Dobson	Weekend Courier
Stephanie	Felstead	CSBP
Allan	Gade	Conservation of Rockingham Environment
Brian	Gardner	Coogee Chemicals
Debbie	Hoey	Kwinana Industries Council
Sarah	Hughes	BP Refinery
Peter	Knol	Dept of Environment & Conservation
Barry	Nelson	Local Resident
John	Newton	BP Refinery
Chris	Oughton	Kwinana Industries Council
John	Rayner	BP Refinery
Tom	Rose	Cockburn Sound Management Council
Shoba	Senasinghe	Coogee Chemicals
Mark	Taylor	Verve Energy
Gino	Valenti	Fremantle Ports
Ivan	Unkovich	Water Corporation
John	Wilks	Hismelt

APOLOGIES

Mayor Carol	Adams	Town of Kwinana
Annette	Gade	Conservation of Rockingham Environment
Cllr Sandra	Lee	Town of Kwinana
Rod	Mapstone	Alcoa
Peter	Macrae	Dept of Mines & Petroleum
Lorna	Petchell	BHP Billiton (Nickel West)
Les	Vogiatzakis	Coogee Chemicals
Cllr Ruth	Alexander	Town of Kwinana

1. OPENING AND WELCOME

In the absence of the forum's facilitator Ron Kemp, Chris Oughton, CIF Executive, facilitated the meeting. He welcomed attendees and asked everyone to sign the attendance register. To be eligible to vote at each AGM people must have attended at least three meetings during the preceding twelve months. He advised attendees of the emergency evacuation procedure for the building and the location of exit doors and muster points.

2. GENERAL ADMINISTRATION

Chris Oughton presented the report from the CIF Executive meeting held 6th September 2011 which considered the requests to make presentations at tonight's meeting and agreed the following presentations to be made, viz:

1. An overview of the Woodman Point incident from the Water Corporation
2. The results of the Kwinana children's respiratory health study, by Peter Franklin of the University of Western Australia.

If people have any suggestions for future presentations or guest speakers, they are asked to please advise the CIF Coordinator (Debbie) or complete one of the forms at the back of the room.

The meeting was reminded that there is a vacancy on the CIF executive for a community member if anyone would like to fill that role.

3. MATTERS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MINUTES

Chris Oughton outlined the following clarifications from the previous minutes:

Item 4.1: The question asked by Lynn Woolfenden should read "*I was interested to see that the allocation for graffiti removal was only \$10k. Is that indicative of a reduction of graffiti in the town?*"

The response from Neil Hartley should read: "*We fortunately collect a lot of rates from the industrial area, about \$6m annually that not all of which is spent in the industrial area.*"

Item 4.2, the word "*technique*" to read "*Technip*".

Barry Nelson asked that on page 7 the word "arsenic" be included in his comment ... "*About the soil, I read a report about (arsenic) contamination in that area.*"

He asked that his question as quoted on page 8: *Also in relation to his question on ground water monitoring, the word "outside" to replace "inside" the fence.*

Barry Nelson advised that he did not agree with the wording of item 5.2 ...

"Barry Nelson commented on a FOI issue he had experienced in 2006. After listening to Barry's comments, Ron Kemp confirmed with him that it was a private matter and should not be included in the meeting's minutes."

His comment was noted by the meeting.

4. PRESENTATIONS

4.1 An overview of the Woodman Point incident from the Water Corporation – presented by Ivan Unkovich.

Over a 16 day period in September the Water Corporation experienced an incident with a failed valve on the Woodman Point WWTP effluent line which prevented normal pumping of treated wastewater down the SDOOL and discharge off Point Peron.

The treatment plant is just south of the Coogee township and services the area south of the Swan River. It caters for waste water from a population of 600,000 and receives 130ML of waste water into that plant daily. The waste is principally water – 99.97%.

An explanation of how the plant works was provided to the meeting and how effluent is discharged. There are emergency pipelines in place for major electrical faults or mechanical issues, the frequency of which is expected to occur only every 10-20 years.

Around the clock manning of the plant and use of conveyance system diversions and storage was used to minimise releases of treated wastewater.

Over the two and a half weeks of the incident the Water Corporation was required to remove and isolate the offending valve. A total of 15.2 ML of treated wastewater was discharged during the first week through the licensed Cockburn Sound contingency outlet. This was less than 1.5% of the daily inflow and sampling of ocean waters and shoreline indicated no observable impact. This is not dissimilar to other Water Corporation ocean outlets.

The meeting was given an explanation of how the process was handled to rectify the situation of putting in a temporary installation of the valve and the reinstatement of replacement valve. The Water Corporation has a number of these types of valves in water installations.

A large steel frame was fabricated, anchored to ground piles and weighed down by concrete blocks to ensure safe conditions for workers to remove the failed butterfly valve. A replacement system will be installed over the next six months.

Overall the environmental impact of the incident is considered to be very low and the relevant regulators and stakeholders were kept closely informed of progress. The contingency outlet built in 1966 has been brought into use. Less than 2ML per day over 8 days was released as waste water and in the second week there was no release of waste water. Ocean water sampling was done on 11th September and all results were clear and the City of Cockburn's increased beach sampling also showed that the water was clear. The Water Corporation liaised closely with a number of government agencies and local councils.

The Water Corporation maintained daily updates of the situation on its website to advise and assure the public of how the matter was being handled.

The Water Corporation is now planning to ensure that the same situation does not arrive in the future.

Question and Answers

Barry Nelson

Q: You say the plant is only 10 years old so I am surprised you don't have any block valves spare. Block valves are standard practice in most heavy industry, and you said you will ensure valves installed are up to the required standards, but the fact that you don't have a spare on the shelf I think is amazing, because it's a critical part. Most industries carry spare parts.

A: The plant at Woodman Point started in 1966 and we have done upgrades in 1976, 1984, 2002 and we have just completed another one. The valve was designed and installed ten years ago and that was done for a particular reason. I don't have all that

information available here but we have looked at other similar situations in our plans to upgrade equipment. In regard to having spares, we have millions of dollars in spares. We would normally assign life of about 50 years to these types of valves and we have a replacement timeframe so we can assign funds as equipment needs replacing. We are currently reviewing the use of this type of valve.

Tom Rose

Q: When the discharged occurred at the end of the pipe was it visible?

A: No. It is in 17 metres of water, and it is treated waste water, and at a flow rate of 100L per second, it is very unlikely to be visible.

Q: Have you looked at the stream coming from the KWRP plant? That's a brown murky colour. I was wondering if that was the same colour that would've been released or would it have been clear.

A: Our tests showed everything was clear.

Q: Will there be a public release of a summary about this kind of incident, so the community can hear what the Water Corporation has learned and how serious it was.

A: We had a daily update on our website, and this presentation will be put on our website.

Allan Gade

Q: You said you only expect this type of incident to happen once every 10 to 20 years. I've seen discharging from the plant to Cockburn Sound happen three times in the last five years. I have reported it to the Water Corporation and they denied it and then one of their people agreed it did happen.

A: When we had wet winters and with the housing development in the Yangebup area, there was flooding in the Yangebup, Bibra Lakes area and to counteract that there was a pumping system installed on Beeliar Road so the excessive discharge from those lakes is discharged through the contingency outlet during very wet winters. So when it's not being used for a contingency of the Woodman Point Plant, it's used for drainage water from the lakes.

Q: This stuff smelt like sewerage, because I was driving past and smelt it. I stopped and went in there and checked and it was sewerage. It was being dispatched out from Woodman's Point. I was in the car.

A: I can't dispute that you saw it but it's discharged 1.6km off shore.

Q: When was the last time the valve was checked? You said it had been there for ten years.

A: The normal situation with the valves is that you service the spindles and motors and operate the valve to open and close and check that they are stopping flow. That is the testing that is undertaken.

Q: And you didn't find anything wrong when you were doing the testing?

A: No.

Q: Yet you're saying that one side of it seized.

A: The Water Corporation with the pipeline to Kalgoorlie and the Great Southern and with the seawater desalination plants, has hundreds of kilometres of large size pipes and vales and we have a lot of experience. The normal situation is that they will last 40-50 years.

Tom Rose

Q: Would it help if you advised how often maintenance is done by the Water Corporation – is it annually, monthly, weekly?

A: It is done on a risk based assessment so some items that are more fragile are inspected more frequently and those that are considered less of a risk are inspected less frequently.

Peter Cole- DEC

Q: Just to clarify, what I understand is that the Water Corporation does very regular maintenance and checks lubricants and valve systems, and during those checks the valves are also checked.

A: It also depends on manufacturers' and suppliers' recommendations. We are doing an investigation of the exact failure of this valve.

Barry Nelson

Q: How many valves of this size do you have?

A: I'd say tens, if not hundreds.

Q: So why don't you have any spares?

A: This was a butterfly valve. I don't know exactly how many we have. When we look for the spare valves there were some available in Melbourne and there are other facilities using them. We have restored the situation now and we will now examine the reason for the failure. We will select a system that we believe will prevent that failure occurring in the future.

There were no further questions. The meeting thanked Ivan for his presentation.

5.2 The results of the Kwinana children's respiratory health study, presented by Peter Franklin of the University of Western Australia

This presentation covered the main findings from the study. In 2009 a study was conducted on the respiratory health of children living in Kwinana. The results of that study have been finalised. The objective of this study is to present the results of the study the Kwinana community.

A respiratory health study of Kwinana children was conducted in 2009. This included a questionnaire of the children's respiratory symptoms and disease, completed by each child's parents, and measures of the children's lung function. Comparisons were made with data from similar tests conducted on children in other areas of Perth.

There was no evidence that children in Kwinana had more current respiratory symptoms than children from other areas of Perth. However, children who had lived in Kwinana from a very early age (< 3 years) had more reported wheeze throughout their life, but not currently, than children who had moved to Kwinana after the age of three years and children from other areas of Perth. There was no difference in either lung function or allergic sensitisation between children from Kwinana and children from other areas of Perth.

Overall the respiratory health of Kwinana children is no different to the respiratory health of children from other areas of Perth but the higher prevalence of wheezy episodes in children who had lived in Kwinana from before the age of three years should be investigated further.

Questions and Answers

Tom Rose

- Q:** You had a slide there showing symptoms and the test variables and you had "no, no, no" against significance. When you look at each one individually you can see in many cases some are either below or above the ACHAPs figures. Is it legitimate to say, five or six out of nine is significant?
- A:** No not really – some are highly correlated and the reasons there is a "no" is because all factors have been taken into account. So for example there were more smokers in this group and it is associated with smoking in the house. So for each of these numbers, there is a lot of overlap between the two groups.
- Q:** I know it was a difficult question to answer but I was wondering about the technical assessments, whether the statistics are provided.
- A:** Yes we have a full report with all the statistics included in it. Not everyone wants to read through all the statistics.

Barry Nelson

- Q:** Can the results of the Busselton study be compared with your study?
- A:** We did think about that study and may in the future do a comparison, but that study is mostly done with adults. In 2005 they included children. It is not beyond possibility to do a comparison. I work with people who controlled the Busselton study so we could do that.

There were no further questions. The meeting thanked Peter for his presentation

GENERAL BUSINESS

Mark Taylor, Environmental officer, Verve Energy, provided an update on the bio spill that occurred on the 22nd July 2011. Approximately 1.5 to 3 tonnes of fly ash entered Cockburn Sound through an outlet channel. A hazop was conducted at the beginning of August and involved maintenance, operation, and engineering staff. All aspects of the fly ash operation were reviewed.

The main reason for the spill was identified as being the level indicator in the spoil pit that holds the fly ash prior to it being pumped out to the fly ash facility failed. It showed an empty tank and the reason for the failure has been established as being the turbulence in the spoil pit clogging up the ultrasonic sensor. That gave a false low indication which allowed other pumps to start pumping into the tank. The result was that the tank overflowed into the storm water system.

As a consequence of this incident, Verve Energy is looking at the bunding of the tank which was found to be inadequate for the type of flows expected when all of the pumps were pumping at the same time. Another factor was because of the low indication, the pumps that pump the fly ash out of the system were locked out to protect them.

A number of actions have come from the review of the incident to prevent it from occurring in the future. The offending part of the plant has been shut down after 40 years service

There were no questions from the meeting.

General Business Questions

Barry Nelson

Q: You might want to take this on notice. Page 3 of the last minutes states "*Allan Gade noted his understanding that the forum had agreed not to continue with this matter. That was my understanding of it.*" My question was regarding the asbestos.

Chris Oughton noted Barry's comment.

Tom Rose

Q: As a member of the community, we had an interesting talk about local content some time ago. I would love to see how things are progressing, or if they're not. We've had a number of big announcements and I was wondering if there'd been any change in local employment as a result of very stringent local content conditions. Is there a chance to get an update?

Chris Oughton

A: I am sure we could ask James England if he would like to give an update on this subject.

There being no further business Chris Oughton thanked all for their attendance and invited them to stay and have refreshments. The meeting closed at 6.50pm.