

COMMUNITIES AND INDUSTRIES FORUM (CIF)

A forum for communication between industry and the community -all welcome

Minutes of the Meeting held Tuesday 2nd June 2009, 5.30 pm – 7.20 pm at the Kwinana Recquatic, Gilmore Avenue, Kwinana

PRESENT

Carol	Adams	Town of Kwinana
Don	Allanach	Homestead Ridge Progress Association
Marilee	Briggs	Hillman resident
Kim	Calver	Thomson Environmental Systems
Peter	Christian	Verve Energy
Stephen	Clark	Coast Care
Ethan	Clark	Coast Care
Natascha	Wachte	Coast Care
Patrick	Coffey	Alcoa
Bob	Cooper	CIF Executive & Rotary Wellard
Erin	Davey	BP Refinery
Leon	Ebbelaar	Cottesloe
Steph	Felstead	CSBP
Allan	Gade	Conservation of Rockingham Environment
Annette	Gade	Conservation of Rockingham Environment
Stan	Hall	Kwinana Progress Association
Steve	Hesse	Kwinana Progress Association
Melanie	Kenny	Verve Energy
Leigh	Liley	Councillor, Rockingham
Peter	Knol	DEC
Rod	Mapstone	Alcoa
Sue	Mckenzie	Water Corporation
Hany	Matar	BOC
Frank	Mofflin	BHP Billiton
Ryan	Munro	Town of Kwinana
Barry	Nelson	Kwinana Progress Association
Val	Oliver	City of Cockburn Councillor
Chris	Oughton	Kwinana Industries Council
Patrick	Peake	Western Energy
Lorna	Petchell	BHP Billiton Nickel West
Fran	Rhodes	Cottesloe
Chris	Tanner	Town of Kwinana
Samantha	Torrens	CSBP
Ivan	Unkovich	Water Corporation
Craig	Wilson	Coastcare
David	Whittaker	LandCorp

APOLOGIES

Tom	Rose	Cockburn Sound Management Council
Les	Vogiatzakis	Coogee Chemicals
Thys	Heyns	BP Refinery
Peter	Macrae	Dept of Mines and Petroleum
Yvonne	Thompson	Weekend Courier
Debbie	Hoey	Kwinana Industries Council
David	Swallow	Water Corporation

Facilitator Ron Kemp advised that Chad Bishop who has represented BP at this forum for around ten years has retired. The meeting acknowledged Mr Bishop's contribution over many years.

1. OPENING AND WELCOME

Ron Kemp (Facilitator) opened the meeting and requested all attendees sign the attendance register to ensure an accurate record of attendees was maintained. The Facilitator advised attendees of the emergency evacuation procedure for the building and the location of exit doors and muster points. The meeting was advised of the need for people to register in order to be eligible to vote at the next AGM, which is the next meeting. People must have attended at least three meetings during the last twelve months to be eligible to vote.

2. GENERAL ADMINISTRATION

Report to CIF Meeting from the CIF executive meeting held 3 May 2009

Chris Oughton, CIF Executive, reported that with regards to the minutes of the last meeting the names of some people asking questions could not be clearly identified from the attendance register and therefore the names were unable to be included in the minutes. On behalf of the CIF executive he apologised for the exclusion of names and asked that if anyone can provide assistance they should contact CIF Coordinator Debbie Hoey and the minutes will be amended.

He further advised that the CIF executive has agreed a process to prevent this occurring again. The facilitator will repeat the name of the person asking the question and repeat the question so that the minute taker is able to record the details correctly. This will assist in providing accurate minutes.

The CIF Executive met on 5 May 2009 to consider the requests to make presentations at tonight's meeting. Tonight's presentations are:

- The presentation of prizes to the winners of the KIC Coastal Competition for 2009
- An overview of the high efficiency gas turbine project at Kwinana by Verve Energy
- An update on the Baldivis pipeline spill by BHP Billiton
- A presentation on the East Rockingham waste water treatment plant

If any attendees have suggestions for future presentations or guest speakers, please advise the CIF Coordinator (Debbie) or complete one of the forms at the back of the room.

The next CIF meeting on **4 August** is also the **Annual General Meeting** and will include the election of community representatives. Nomination forms will be sent out to all community members who are eligible to nominate. Completed forms **must** be returned to the CIF Coordinator one week prior to the AGM as stated in the CIF Charter. They will not be accepted at the meeting. To be eligible to vote attendees must have attended at least three CIF meetings in the last financial year, hence the importance of signing the attendance register when attending CIF meetings.

3. MATTERS ARISING FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING

There were no matters arising from the previous meeting.

4. PRESENTATIONS

4.1 Coastcare Winners 2009

Craig Wilson made the presentations and advised that this is the second year of the photo competition. It provides an opportunity for amateur photographers to take photographs in the Kwinana / Rockingham region, to showcase what is good about the coastal region. The winners' photographs were on display at the back of

the meeting. Craig thanked the KIC for sponsoring the program which it is hoped will build over the years and it also provide opportunities to use photographs submitted in promoting the region.

Prizes this year were a Nikon Camera. Winners were as follows: Student winner – Morgan Cooper; Mobile Phone Category – youngest entrant – Ethan Clark, Leon Evelar who was unable to be present and Sheila Hairs received a special commendation award.

4.2 High Efficiency Gas Turbine Project

Peter Christian – Verve Energy

The government has announced it will provide \$260M to Verve to build, own and operate two high efficiency gas turbines. This action is being taken because

- on current forecasts, a new plant will be required on the SWIS for the summer of 2011/12.
- Verve is the only provider obligated to provide a balancing service in the market. Currently this is being carried out by unsuitable plants.
- There is a need to have the best mid-merit/peaking plant available.

Verve has chosen to build two high efficiency gas turbines. They will be located at the present site of the Kwinana Power Station Stage B boiler site and will utilise existing Stage AB cooling water systems. They will be gas fuelled using gas freed up by the shutdown of Stage B, but will also be able to burn distillate which provide energy security. Distillate is likely to be used for only two days a year. The start up date is October 2011.

The plants will have best practice equipment which will ensure better efficiency than all alternative plants. They will have fast start up capability, being 10 mins to full load as against 4-16 hours for thermal units. They will allow accurate and instantaneous tracking of variations in load. There will be reduced carbon emissions from the new plants and environmental benefits include reduced nitrogen oxides, sulphur dioxide and particulate emissions. They will have dual-fuel (gas or liquid fuel) capability and will provide sustained hot day performances.

Significant environmental issues that will be addressed include reduced discharges to Cockburn Sound by using seawater to cool the system. There will be lower air and noise emissions, reduced greenhouse gases. The presentation showed the statistics on air and noise emission improvements that will be achieved. Noise issues with Naval Base Hotel are being addressed and the new plant will ensure that Verve will not be a significant contributor to assigned noise level exceedances at the closest residence.

A detailed site contamination investigation has been completed and found that there was hydrocarbons next to the set step-up transformers. This is being addressed, as is the minor groundwater contamination found west of the set-up transformers and some contaminated sludge in drains. Contaminated soil will be removed and groundwater will be monitored after the new plants are built. An explanation of the improvement the plants will bring in reduced greenhouse gasses was provided.

The existing turbine hall will remain and will house the intercooler. There will be two enclosed gas compressors. All construction and laydown will occur on the Kwinana site and an individual risk analysis has shown the risk to be very low. When completed the plants will be remotely operated and will be integrated into Kwinana's ISO 14001 certified system

Questions and Answers

Leigh Liley – Rockingham Councillor

Q: You indicate that the contaminated soils are going to be removed. Where will they be removed to?

A: Most of the soil under the transformers is contaminated to a very low level at class 2. There is some soil that is contaminated to a higher level. All will be going to landfill sites licensed to take contaminated soils. There is a Standard issued by DEC about levels of contamination that will be complied with. We will use a consultant to ensure it goes to the appropriate sites.

Allan Gade, CORE

Q: You said you have to recompress the gas because it's not under enough pressure. The Bunbury/Perth gas pipeline pumping station next to Wesfarmers is extremely noisy. Are you going to be able to contain the noise?

A: The plant will range from 3.7 to 6 megapascals. We have specified enclosed compressors but I will follow up on that for you and get some information.

Steve Hesse - KPW

Q: What are the existing boundary noise levels and what are the predicted noise levels?

A: Levels at the Naval Base Hotel which is not far from our boundary will be well below 50 decibels.

Q: Why did Western Power apply to the government for an exemption against the Noise Regulations?

A: When Cockburn Power Station was put in in the early 2000's it was thought that the levels from all of our installations would exceed the assigned levels. That would have been a problem. The Naval Base Hotel still has accommodation so we put a Regulation 17 in place but we have not proceeded with it. We will be doing our utmost to get the levels from our entire plant below the levels required by the Naval Base Hotel.

Q: So Verve is meeting its noise regulations on its boundaries currently?

A: Yes. The only occasion we weren't was at start up and that's why we put those big silencers on the exhausts.

Q: Verve knows that the community environmental groups support gas rather than coal and have done for some time, but we are disappointed about the dual fuel especially with the double emissions if it's run on diesel. How long will it be run on liquid fuel?

A: We hope never because using diesel is very expensive. The only reason we're doing it is for energy security. I can assure you if we can get the gas we'll run on gas and not distillate.

Q: Why does the contaminated soil have to go to a landfill or a rubbish tip and be buried so it can contaminate more land? Why can't it be treated at the hazardous waste plants we have around the state and around Australia? I thought that Verve would want to do the right thing there

A: We're doing exactly what's required, and hopefully a bit more. If it were highly contaminated we would do that but this is relatively low contamination. The contamination in the soil by the transformers is very low and only a small amount needs to go to a Class 3 site.

There were no further questions and the facilitator thanked the presenters for the presentation. Peter Christian invited any attendees who may have further comments to contact him via email. His address was provided in his presentation.

4.3 Update on Baldvis Pipeline Spill (6.30pm – 6.45pm)

Frank Mofflin, Environment and Community Superintendent BHP Billiton Kwinana Nickel Refinery (KNR) presented an update of an event that occurred twelve

months ago, and some information on other activities being undertaken by KNR. The presentation commenced with background information on KNR.

As presented at the October 2008 CIF Forum, there was a leak from the pipeline between KNR and the Baldivis facility, 400m south east from the corner of Old Mandurah Road and Gilmour Avenue. The 600m³ of effluent contained water, ammonium sulphate and trace metals. After the immediate clean up response the failed pipeline was decommissioned and three groundwater recovery bores and five monitoring bores were installed. The recovered ground water was initially pumped to evaporation cells at Baldivis and subsequently a pipeline was installed within the casing of the failed pipeline which meant material could then be transferred to a staging pond at Baldivis. This enabled the water to be returned to the refinery site, and used as processed water.

The water treatment plant (wtp) at KNR is a reverse osmosis wtp which takes high conductivity water and produces two streams of water. One being a low conductivity water stream which can be used as processed water and reduces the need for scheme water. The other stream is a high conductivity water stream which is transferred to evaporation cells at Baldivis. The wtp processes ground water, refinery effluent and the ground water that has been recovered from the leak site. So far 19,700m³ ground water have been recovered from the leak site. Calcium sulphate, which emanated from the recovered ground water, was found to be defouling on the membranes and was removed. This issue has been addressed by KNR. Monthly and quarterly monitoring has been undertaken at the leak site and is showing the contaminants at the site have decreased significantly. The total recovery of the site is expected to be completed by December 2009. There are a number of pipelines that run between KNR and Baldivis and all three are being replaced, to be completed by 30 June 2010. Revegetation of the site has been affected by the late arrival of winter this year but will commence as soon as winter rains are received.

The Environmental Improvement Plan which KNR has been working with members of the community was discussed. Excellent contributions had been made from all participants which has identified priority areas of concerns, i.e. refinery emissions, product and feedstock storage, energy efficiency, odour and ground water contamination. KNR is close to finalising the EIP.

A brief update on the proposed hydrogen plant was provided. Construction was to have commenced in 2009 but due to global economic circumstances this has been delayed and the project is being reviewed to see if cost saving measures can be implemented. Any further changes will be made known to the community.

Questions and Answers

Allan Gade - CORE

Q: The odour from the Baldivis ponds is still evident.

A: KNR recently completed odour modeling at Baldivis. The concentrations showed it was unlikely that the odour from the evaporation cells would extend far from that site. This information was submitted last week to the DEC.

Q: I suggest that you get your modeling checked. We're getting it in Hillman.

A: I understand that it's a concern. What's the description of the odour?

Q: It's very different. I was blaming the Miller Road tip until we found out it wasn't them. I've got the coordinates at home. When you standing outside your boundary where the ponds are the odour comes from there. It's an ammonia type odour

A: We have treated the evaporation cell to reduce that odour and we did the modeling prior to treating that evaporation cell to reduce that ammonia odour.

Steve Hesse

Q: On the changes to the hydrogen plant, won't that need to undergo environmental approvals?

A: Yes, if we do make changes to that it will be re-submitted to the DEC as well as being shared with the community.

Q: We met with KNR management soon after the leak and asked for the KNR report but we're still waiting for that report to be made public. We could FOI it but I don't see why we should have to use our money when BHP should make it publicly available.

A: I'll follow that up for you.

There were no further questions and the facilitator thanked Chris for his presentation.

4.4 East Rockingham Wastewater Treatment Plant

Steve Mackenzie, representing David Swallow who was ill and unable to attend, made the presentation. He advised that his background is communications not technical and he offered to take any questions that he was unable to answer back to his office for a response. Ivan Unkovich who also attended the meeting offered to assist with any technical questions.

Water Corporation has three major wastewater treatment plants (wwtp) operating – Beenyup, Subiaco, and Woodman Point. A fourth major wwtp is being built at Alkimos, which will be 160mL/day and is a similar size to Woodman Point and the same size as proposed for East Rockingham.

The catchment area for East Rockingham includes Kwinana wwtp which has recently been upgraded and the Pt Peron wwtp which currently operates at 20mL/day. The Kwinana wwtp has recently been upgraded to 12mL/day.

A value management study was undertaken to look at optimal locations and identified five options within the East Rockingham area. A summary of the options was provided in the presentation. Considerations were cost, power requirements and greenhouse gas emissions and Option 2 was the lowest cost and most sustainable option. The Pt Peron plant will be decommissioned when this new plant is built. The location for the plant is within the IP 14 area. It will be situated on 31Ha of land, which is subject to environmental approvals and if environmental approvals are granted, the land will be purchased from LandCorp. An artists impression of the plant when finalised was presented.

Implementation will be staged. Stage 1 will be 40mL/day by 2015. Stage 2 80mL/day by 2027, stage 3 120mL/day by 2040 and stage 4 160mL/day by 2070. At ultimate capacity the plant will provide waste water services to 800,000. It is equivalent to the current size of Woodman Point.

The environmental approval document will be submitted to federal regulatory authorities and then to state authorities. If all approvals are granted the site position and preliminary design will be undertaken with project completion scheduled for 2015.

Odour management is a critical issue for the Water Corporation. The proposed is 1.5km from the nearest housing which is sufficient distance for an odour buffer. The plant will be built using latest technology and will incorporate a high degree of odour control. There will be adequate protection for the people in Hillman. Statistics on residential properties in relation to other wwtps was provided. WWTPs provide opportunities for water recycling. Treated water from the East Rockingham wwtp will be discharged to the ocean through the existing sepiia depression ocean outlet landline. The quality of the discharged water is monitored by an independent

panel of scientists and it has been proven that the water is not harming the marine environments or the surrounding beaches.

Questions and Answers

Carol Adams, Town of Kwinana

Q: You only talked about Hillman and not about the Town of Kwinana. How did your modeling address the issues? Can you give an undertaking that your plant will be situated as close as possible to industry and as far away as possible to residences.

A: We have located the plant as far away as possible from Hillman and other residents. We propose to locate it optimally that will protect houses from odours and will also give some protection to the wider industrial area as well.

Marilee Briggs Hillman Resident

Q: I lived opposite the Mallabar sewerage treatment plant in NSW for a number of years. I looked at your plan 15 years ago and was informed that this plant would be state-of-the-art, underground, no open pits. I want to know why this plant will be above ground. Unless the plant is covered we will be affected by the odour. It is not 1.5km from Hillman residents. In relation to putting the waste out to sea, what is that going to do to Cockburn Sound?. How technologically advanced is this plant going to be and I want guarantees from the Water Corporation that I am not going to be affected by the odours.

A: I don't know the background to the plant you've referred to. This is going to be a state of the art plant. All the odourous parts of the plant will be covered by 2060. We have spent \$137m on the Woodman Point plant and have reduced odours by 50%. This work is completed and monitoring and modeling on that is ongoing. I am happy to look at the buffer again. The buffer at Woodman point is 750m.

Ivan Unkovic, Operations Manager for WWT in the metropolitan area addressed the issue of discharge into Cockburn Sound. He advised that he had visited the Mallabar treatment plant and is familiar with that plant. The reason it is underground is principally because of the surrounding sewer network systems. It is not appropriate to compare plants built in the 1960s and 1970s to today's plants. A similar plant being built at Alkimos will start operation in December 2010 and will give people an idea of what how the East Rockingham facility will operate in 2015. We have upgraded the technology at the Subiaco wwtp, which has a 600m buffer and have not had one complaint.

Q: If you're building a brand new plant, wouldn't it be better to get it correct from the beginning. Sink it, because that's the way of the future. In Queensland the majority of plants them are all below ground because it reduces the odour.

A: We believe that covering the treatment units that emit the odours combined with the 600m+ buffer we will not inconvenience people outside the buffer zone. Regarding the discharge into the ocean, as Ivan Unkovich stated the current pipelines goes off Cape Peron into the sepia depression, 4kms off shore. The likelihood of the seawater desalination plant pulling in effluent is very low.

Allan Gade - CORE

Q: I have a statement from the residents of Hillman concerning David Swallow. I and the residents of Hillman were appalled by your smirk and lack of respect at the presentation to Hillman residents and believe that you personally (this relates to David Swallow) believe that the Kwinana electorate is a low socioeconomic area and we are all idiots. This is totally untrue. We have many professionals in our area and we have just as much right for respect as any

other community. To conclude I suggest that you personally never address a group until you change your attitude and treat people with the respect they deserve, especially when it is the blue collar workers of this country and tax payers in general, who pay your wage. Thank you.

A: I'll convey the information back to David and if that's the impression that he gave I apologise.

Q: And just one more thing, Mayor Adams mentioned the odour buffer affecting Leda. You need to go back to the drawing board with your modeling because it is totally wrong. It's going to affect Hillman, Leda and a lot of other areas in the Kwinana electorate.

A: **Ivan Unkovich.** We have used odour experts from the Eastern States, and Ian Wallace from Wallace Consulting in Melbourne conducts odour management audits on a monthly basis. We take his advice and have done for the last seven years ago for Subiaco and for each major upgrading of the treatment plants. We use a computer wind data to model. The East Rockingham plant is going to be better than the Subiaco plant and will have a higher level of odour management to ensure people are not inconvenienced outside the buffer zone.

Steve Hesse - KPA

Q: Isn't it misleading for Water Corporation to keep claiming that they're using world's best practice, best technology and so forth when covering a plant is best practice, best technology and this plant isn't going to be covered? Why can't we have the best technology?

A: We are trialling new technology at Woodman Point, using bioscrubbers and chemical treatments which is proving very effective. We are covering the most odourous parts of the plants and this is proving to be very effective. We are making advances all the time and in this new plant that will be continuously improved.

Q: You made the statement that this plant will use existing line out to the sepia depression. When the desal plant was built we wanted the Water Corporation to put the waste water from the desal plant out to the sepia depression through that line. The claim was made that there wasn't enough capacity in that line. How will there be enough capacity to carry 160mL a day?

A: We will be doing a duplication of the pipelines. It will run parallel to the existing pipeline.

Q: Regarding the odour issue, I would put it to this meeting that the chances of Kwinana, excluding Calista and Leeder, being affected by odour are probably more than Hilton because of the wind direction, which over 60% of the time blows from that location directly towards Leeder and Calista.

A: Our modeling and research indicates that is not the case. We've done odour modeling for all winds over a few years. We've cross-referenced the wind data at East Rockingham with the details from other wwtps. We believe we have a good scientific basis for our claims.

Marilee Briggs- Hillman resident

Q: I'm sorry to be so cynical but I have lived in the area for 25 years and we get convergences when CALM do their burn-offs. I'd like to see how you've done your wind modeling so could you please get to me all of your studies so I can look at them and get my own personal interpretation done by an expert. Who is paying for this? Is the federal government contributing to this as well as the state government? I pay my water and sewerage rates and I want a state of the art facility which is underground and not open pits.

A: They're not underground and they're not open pits. As mentioned we have used Ian Wallace who has also attended public meetings.

The facilitator then reiterated for the meeting that all guest speakers are willing to stay back at the conclusion of the meeting so people can discuss further personal or specific information.

5. GENERAL BUSINESS

There was no general business raised.

6. DATE AND TIME OF NEXT MEETING

People were asked to complete the attendance register prior to leaving the meeting. The next meeting will be the Annual General Meeting and will be held on **Tuesday 4 August 2009**, 5.30pm at Kwinana Recquatic, Gilmore Avenue, Kwinana.