

COMMUNITIES AND INDUSTRIES FORUM (CIF)

A forum for communication between industry and the community

**Minutes of the Meeting held Tuesday 7 April 2009, 5.30 pm – 7.45pm
at the Kwinana Recquatic, Gilmore Avenue, Kwinana**

PRESENT

Don	Allanach	Homestead Ridge Progress Association
Chris	Brady	LandCorp
Chad	Bishop	BP Refinery
Karen	Boyce	Tiwest
Kim	Calver	Thomson Environmental Systems
Eileen	Chapman	Kwinana Progress Association
Patrick	Coffey	Alcoa
Bob	Cooper	CIF Executive & Rotary Wellard
Jason	Cullen	BP Refinery
Graham	Davey	Kwinana Progress Association
Fred	Eroltsieck	Friends of the Spectacles
Annette	Gade	Conservation of Rockingham Environment
Allan	Gade	Conservation of Rockingham Environment
Arthur	Grieco	Dept of Environment & Conservation
Stan	Hall	Kwinana Progress Association
Margaret	Hall	Kwinana Progress Association
Steve	Hesse	Kwinana Progress Association
Debbie	Hoey	Kwinana Industries Council
Robert	Hughes	Dept of Environment & Conservation
Dawn	Jecks	Greens WA
Karl	Koevaen	Sita Biowise
Rod	Lukatellch	BP Refinery
Peter	Metcalfe	BP Refinery
Patricia	Moreton	Kwinana Progress Association
Paul	MacPhail	Windsor Hills
Peter	Macrae	Dept of Mines & Petroleum
Barry	Nelson	Kwinana Progress Association
Chris	Oughton	Kwinana Industries Council
Lorna	Petchell	BHP Billiton Nickel West
Gordon	Reva	Windsor Hills
Darren	Salamon	Terminals West
Shoba	Senasinghe	Coogee Chemicals
John	Sutton	Dept of Environment & Conservation
Renee	Sutton	Water Corporation
Chris	Tanner	Town of Kwinana
Mark	Taylor	Verve
Yvonne	Thompson	Weekend Courier
Samantha	Torrens	CSBP
Ivan	Unkovich	Water Corporation
Les	Vogiatzakis	Coogee Chemicals
Helen	Walker	Parmelia
Adam	West	Dept of Environment & Conservation

APOLOGIES

Frank	Mofflin	BHP Billiton
Peter	Christian	Verve Energy
Tony	Wynne	Dept of Environment & Conservation
Tom	Rose	Cockburn Sound Management Council

1. **Opening and Welcome**

Ron Kemp (Facilitator) opened the meeting and requested all attendees sign the attendance register to ensure an accurate record of attendees was maintained. The Facilitator advised attendees of the emergency evacuation procedure for the building and the location of exit doors and muster points. The meeting was advised of the need for people to register in order to be eligible to vote at the next AGM. People must have attended at least three meetings during the last twelve months.

2. **General Administration**

Report From the CIF Executive Meeting Held 3 March 2009

The CIF Executive met on 3 March 2009 to consider the requests to make presentations at tonight's meeting. Tonight's presentations are:

- BP Refinery on their G10 Diesel Capability Improvement
- Water Corporation will provide a report on the removal of biosolids from the Kwinana Wastewater Treatment Plant, and
- The Department of Environment will brief the forum on the removal of the air quality monitoring station from Hope Valley.

If you have any suggestions for future presentations or guest speakers, please advise the CIF Coordinator (Debbie Hoey) or complete one of the forms at the back of the room.

3. **Matters arising from the previous meeting**

There were no matters arising from the previous minutes.

4. **Presentations**

4.1 **BP Refinery - G10 Diesel Capability Improvement: Chad Bishop and Jason Cullen**

Commencing 1 January 2009, the Australian Federal Government implemented new legislation on diesel manufacturing specifications which requires that all diesel product must contain less than 10 ppm sulphur.

BP Refinery Kwinana employs 'hydroprocessing' technology to remove sulphur from diesel. Without implementing any changes, the new specifications stretch the capability of existing equipment and restrict capacity.

A refinery project is currently underway to revamp one of two diesel hydroprocessing units at the refinery to restore diesel desulphurization capacity. The project will also improve energy efficiency (thereby reducing greenhouse gas emissions) and address known reliability issues.

Ivan Ukovich – Water Corporation

Q: In the diagram you referred to gases. What happens to these?

A: They go to other units in the refinery where the valuable LPG components are recovered.

There were no further questions and the facilitator thanked the presenters for their presentation.

4.2 Removal of Biosolids – Ivan Unkovich, Water Corporation

Ivan Unkovich gave the meeting information on the background of biosolids – being stabilized nutrient rich organic residues which are sourced from Subiaco and Beenyup wastewater treatment plants. Up to 5000 wet tonnes has been in storage for almost 2 years and Water Corporation has identified that the material can be used on agricultural land. The biosolids will be excavated over a four to six week period and carted to the designated recipient sites during normal working hours, Mondays to Friday, commencing in May.

Key issues considered include odours and this will be combated by the use of foam sprays being applied to the materials when it is loaded into the trucks. There is likely to be increased noise from the machinery on site and the trucks but onsite machinery will not be any greater than was evident when the treatment plant was being built. Dust will be kept to a minimum and will be controlled by hosing down. A transport route has been chosen and trucks will not be permitted to stop outside sensitive areas such as shopping centres etc.

The community will be advised of this project through the community newspapers and a letter drop will be made to nearby residents and a 13 13 75 telephone number is available for any complaints that may need to be made.

The biosolids are stored in a licensed lagoon on site. This is a non-routine operation for Water Corporation and it is possible that the Kwinana wastewater treatment plant will be used in this way every two to three years.

Questions and Answers

Alan Gade - CORE

Q: You said that trucks are not allowed to park outside shopping centres. Is that because of the odour coming from the trucks.

A: Yes, there may be some possible odours.

Q: How are you going to stop the odours after hours?

A: Our plan is to spread foam spray over the area. If necessary we will also spray with liquid lime as a control measure. We have sprayed the liquid lime before with good effect.

Steve Hesse - KPA

Q: With the buffer zone around the wastewater treatment plant, why does the Water Corporation continue to lease the buffer zone out to offending industries because the Water Corporation itself is an offensive industry.

A: The Water Corporation's land holding is in the north east corner of the Mclaughlan/Anketell Rds intersection as shown in the diagrams. We have a buffer zone of 500m from our boundary. It takes into account any activities within our land holding.

Q: The Water Corporation has been unable to control the odour from the Biowise facility on that section of the land. How can the community have any confidence that the Water Corporation will control the odours from this operation?

A: The Biowise facility is a composting facility of organic matter. It mixes green waste with biosolids which are then placed into biocells for decomposition. The air is sucked from the biocells to minimise the odours released and the air is then put through a compost filter to further reduce the odours. Six weeks later it is placed in the maturation area for further breaking down. Odours may be released if we don't get the mix right so there are variables that we need to manage well. This facility is a joint partnership with Sita and the Water Corporation. It was set up seven years ago to address the storage of biosolids.

Karl Koevort – Biowise Manager

We know there have been some odour incidences at the facility. We don't believe that this is the best forum to discuss these issues, and in the next two weeks we will be setting up a more formal discussion forum.

Name unknown

Q: Why are you unhappy to discuss this issue in a public forum?

A: We believe it would be better to have a working group to work through any issues that arise. We think there will be better outcomes if we do it that way and we invite the community to join this working group.

Steve Hesse

Q: Are there any bundings or concrete floors.

A: Karl Koevort: We have identified areas of concern in the facility. We are very happy to discuss plans and areas for improvement.

Q: Why has the government and council allowed this to go on for so long and done nothing?

A: Chris Tanner, ToK: It has been a concern of Council for sometime and there is ongoing consultation and analysis of the air over the buffer zone to take into account what has happened. Industry licences are issued by the DEC not Council.

Q: There is an issue with flies breeding. Does this come under the Health Department?

A: Karl Koevort: There was a high incidence of fly complaints just before Christmas but I have no evidence of breeding in the compost stockpiles at that time.

Adam West – Dept of Environment & Conservation: There are odours and we are working close with Biowise to reduce them and we will discuss this further with Karl.

Steve Hesse - KPA

As you know, much of the Kwinana community is extremely concerned about the proposal to consider another composting facility on Water Corporation land for domestic waste. I would certainly like to point out to the Water Corporation that the community I deal with is fast running out of patience with Water Corporation and will start to take action if nothing is done about this problem.

Annette Gade - CORE

Q: Regarding the biosolids being trucked to agricultural sites, has the safety aspect been checked out if they are spreading it on land where food is to be grown?

A: A lot of research has been done in WA, Australia and the USA and using biosolids in this way has been going on for more than twenty years with a lot of

scrutiny and research. It has been shown that that when well managed there are no issues.

Q: Pathogens can never be got rid of.

A: Ivan – We operate within the Department of Health guidelines which are set by the DEC and which are strictly adhered. This ensures the risk is extremely low. There is nowhere in the world where there is a zero risk and pathogens do die off more quickly when applied to the land.

Stan Hall

Q: Why are we getting so many flies at this time of the year? I have lived here for 17 years and I have never seen them as bad as they are this year.

A: Karl Koevort: There is no evidence that flies are spreading from the facility. We have regular spraying and baiting programs and we don't have any evidence to show that flies are breeding in the ground.

Eileen Chapman

Q: I came along Anketell and McLaughlan roads and the stink was absolutely disgusting.

A: Ivan Unkovich – I know the area you refer to. I came that way myself tonight before the meeting and got a slight wiff of odour because of the prevailing winds. Within the buffer zone odours are going to be noticed, however we accept they should not be hugely obnoxious odours but this is something that Karl's working party will be addressing.

Name unknown

Q: Biowise is very close to Thomas Road. I can state with certainty that 99% of the time we can smell the odours at our house and we are quite high up. I am having to use my asthma spray weekly now whereas I was using it much less previously.

A: Ivan Unkovich: Any complaints about odours should be phoned through to the DEC.

Alan Gade - CORE

Q: Where is the waste coming from?

A: The biosolids are coming from the Woodman Point wastewater treatment plant, Beenyup and occasionally the Mandurah wastewater treatment plant but generally it is from the Woodman Point facility. In addition grease trap wastes from restaurants and occasionally some organic foodwaste are added to the compost mix.

Dawn Jecks – Greens WA

Q: Can you please tell me a little about the monitoring by the DEC?

A: **Karl Koevort:** We monitor the aerating of the stockpiles, the maturation areas around the facility and the drainage pond. The compost is maintained in accordance with quality standards.

Q: Does the DEC conduct independent monitoring and what surveillance is undertaken by DEC?

A: **Karl Koevort:** We supply reports to the DEC and they come out every three months to check on the facilities.

Adam West - DEC

A: The site is subject to a number of licence conditions which are shown on the department's website.

Ivan Unkovich: In closing I would like to advise that the new Kwinana Treatment Plant is undergoing commissioning which is going well and the Water Corporation now has a plant with sufficient capacity for future growth. Excess effluent will be pumped to the Woodman Point effluent line.

Name unknown

A: You talked about routinely transferring biosolids. Will this movement occur every two to three years?

Q: Ivan Unkovich: Yes, this is part of our biosolids management system.

Steve Hesse

A: If this biosolids coming from Woodman Point, why not process it there?

Q: When we transported it here two years ago it was as an emergency back up. Such an emergency could arise every two to three years and we need to have contingencies in place. It is an organic product that is useful for crop production. Water Corporation did not move it down here because of odour problems at Woodman Point.

There were no further questions and the facilitator thanked the presenters for the presentation.

4.2 Kwinana Air Monitoring at Hope Valley – John Sutton

John Sutton, Air Quality Branch - Dept of Environment and Conservation, outlined the program to expand the air monitoring sites. He explained where the current stations were placed and the rationale for their placement. Since then strategies have been changed as populations and industries have grown. He explained that phase 1 was completed in 2005 and was intended to get information on toxins in the environment, phase 2, completed in 2006, involved three sites which monitored PAH, metals, VOCs and NOx in 2006 and phase 3 covered VOCs, carbonyls, ammonia and was completed in 2008.

The department is now in a position to write up the results of each of these phases which will be presented to the newly established Kwinana Airshed Study Advisory Group. The group has met once and is scheduled to meet again shortly. These phases represent a considerable investment. He noted that there is a child health study being undertaken and the department is assisting in that project, which is scheduled to take place over the next 2-3 years.

He outlined the plans the department has for the future, the investment it has made in new technology and the uses of the technology, being FTIR, PTRMS, LIDAR which will all contribute to the department being able to source more information over greater distances. The investment in this new technologies will significantly improve the departments capacity across the state.

The Hope Valley air quality monitoring station site has been decommissioned because it has outlived its usefulness. The strategy now is to focus on specific pollutants.

Questions and Answers

Steve Hesse

Q: How much funding has been cut in relation to the Kwinana Airshed?

A: Nil. The DEC is subject to the government's required cutbacks as is every other government department. However in regard to Kwinana, we have increased our investment.

Q: DEC is sending out different stories and not telling the public what it saying behind closed doors. I sat on the advisory group and we were told that funding had been cut. The same thing has happened with VOCs. It has been said that the VOC monitoring is not reliable and that there are no air quality problems in Kwinana.

A: DEC is subject to the government's efficiency drive like every government department. The Kwinana sites though are a high priority and we will be increasing our resources in this area. Regarding the VOCs, I am not clear as to what you mean by them not being reliable. We are using technology, passive monitoring and screening level tools to measure over a weekly period. We always recognise within a week period there may be plumes that might increase the levels of concentrates slightly and we need specific information. We are now seeing evidence using the canisters or fixed monitoring situations that peak VOCs are of concern in some circumstances. With the new technologies we will be able to see if there is evidence that has been lost using the canister monitoring.. The passive monitoring doesn't deliver sufficient information about events.

Annette Gade - CORE

Q: Can you explain to me when we first started with the canisters, it was put to the people that we would be helping the Health Department and the community but it took people this year to find out that using the canisters was a waste of time.

A: The intention to use of the canisters was twofold, one was for the gaseous phase, and to get a better understanding of the technology. The human nose can pick up levels of certain compounds below the levels of the technology. The technology has been good in some circumstances and less valuable in others. With the odour content it has not been as useful as we had hoped for. The Department is looking at different strategies for odours.

Dawn Jecks - Greens WA

Q: Has the expenditure been approved for the new technology?

A: We have the funding. We took delivery of the PRRMS the year before last and have had it in the field and been working with CSIRO. We have commissioned some post graduate work with UWA and are now in a position to use that tool with greater effectiveness. We took delivery of the FTFR last week. There are generally lead times in terms of buying sophisticated equipment. We took delivery of LIDAR last November and this is the most advanced system in the world. We're now learning how to use these systems. It will probably be next

year before we are sufficiently competent with the technology to use it out in the field.

Q: Will the equipment give you assistance in monitoring the spikes?

A: Absolutely, it will show the exact times of any spikes. The FTIR works on concentrations over 300-400ppm. The PTRMS gives specific point sources. LIDAR is a laser beam technology and each of these technologies complement each other and each has a specific role to play.

Alan Gade

Q: Regarding the canisters, the formaldehyde readings have been fairly high. How do we know that this is for short term exposure and we are not exposed 24/7?

A: Good point. If we saw something that was significantly elevated we would go back and review it. The new technology is more portable so we can now measure formaldehyde levels more easily. We will be getting community agreement about what the community wants the department to review. LIDAR has a range of 25kms and will enable us to see Kwinana as a whole.

Dawn Jecks – Greens WA

Q: Will this new technology allow you to measure particulates. With 160 truck movements a day that will mean more diesel particulates being produced.

A: We can see diesel particulates with LIDAR and we will collect via the high volume sampler. Particulates is one of the things we analyse. With LIDAR we will be able to send particulates to the laboratory for analysis of various particulates using high volume sampling rather than 24 hour sampling.

John Sutton - we are working with a US colleague using the LIDAR on biosolids. For diesel and vehicle emissions we have also take delivery of a tool that will measure vehicle petrol emissions.

Robert Hughes - We are initially looking at vehicle emissions using a real time sensor to read emissions. This technology has been received and is being trialed and will be used in the city area. People will be able to see the results of the tests immediately.

Steve Hesse

Q: On vehicle emissions, the research that I have been looking at shows that vehicle emissions account for about 13% of pollution. The biggest emitters in Kwinana are industry. How many actual monitors have we got monitoring the residential areas in Kwinana at the moment?

A: The monitoring activities are in phase 2. The main monitoring stations are not in the residential areas. The fixed monitoring stations would not be in the residential areas but we have a range of other programs where we target residential areas to see if there is any evidence of inconsistencies.

There were no further questions and the facilitator thanked John for his presentation.

5. General Business

5.1 Noise Reference Group

Allan Gade, member of the Noise Reference Group, provided the following summary.

- The Noise Reference Group reconvened on 26 February 2009. The group consists of representatives from industry, the three local governments, the DEC and the community. The group is facilitated by Ron Kemp.
- At its first meeting the group discussed and agreed the Terms of Reference which have now been signed off.
- The purpose of the group is to oversee noise monitoring in response to complaints and to try to identify where that noise might be coming from. The data gathered will also be used to recalibrate the existing noise model.
- Paul Drew from Herring Storer will be a regular attendee at the NRG meetings and will provide advice and assistance with noise monitoring planned for April / May 2009.
- At the last meeting on 26 March, the group discussed noise complaints and mapped suggested locations for monitors for the forthcoming noise monitoring.
- The group was aware that there were no industry-related complaints about noise from the Kwinana area and so targeting the monitoring to the suburbs of Calista and Medina would be a good approach.
- We also felt it was important for the process that people did come forward with an noise complaints from this area.
- If anyone from these areas has any noise complaints, can they please pass them on to Debbie at KIC. Same with anyone who knows someone that has had problems.
- There is funding for 'on call' monitoring work to be done if any excessive industry noises are heard
- Paul has provided the group with a proposal for the noise monitoring and model verification which will be discussed further at the next meeting being held on 23 April 2009.
- We plan to have finished the modeling by the end on May, before the weather gets too unstable.

6. Date and time of Next Meeting

The next meeting will be held on **Tuesday 2 June 2009**, 5.30pm at Kwinana Recquatic, Gilmore Avenue, Kwinana. Attendees were asked to complete the attendance register prior to leaving the meeting.