



MINUTES OF MEETING

Held on
Thursday 5 July 2007
2.00pm – 4.00pm
Kwinana Industries Council, 41 Hope Valley Road, Naval Base

Attendees:

Roger Dean (DoIR) – Chair
Sean Parker (Hismelt)
Peter McKenzie (Town of Kwinana)
Kristin Priest (Dept of Environment & Conservation)
Genevieve Mannin (CSBP)
Allan Gade (CIF Community Representative)
Craig Watts (City of Cockburn)
Cr. Rod Pattinson (Town of Kwinana)
Chris Oughton (KIC)
Debbie Hoey (KIC)
Renaë Hibben (KIC)

Apologies:

Linda Griffiths (BHP Billiton)
Peter Christian (Verve Energy)

Guests:

Lynton Storer – Herring Storer Acoustics
Rebecca James – Fremantle Ports

Observer:

Steve Hesse (Kwinana Progress Association)

1. Welcome and Introductions (Roger Dean, Chair)

The Chair welcomed attendees to the meeting and the above apologies were noted. Steve Hesse, Kwinana Progress Association, was attending the meeting as an observer.

2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting Held on 17 April 2007

The minutes of the previous meeting were accepted as a true and accurate record of the meeting.

2.1 Matters Arising

- **Air Liquide** – at the last meeting Ian Hill, Air Liquide, agreed to provide a written response to the questions raised at the meeting. A copy of the response was tabled.
- **Transport noise** – a response from the Dept of Planning and Infrastructure was distributed to members prior the meeting.
- **Representation from DEC** – it was noted that a representative from the DEC was in attendance for today's meeting.

- **Update from Wesfarmers LPG** – Chris Oughton confirmed that he had been in contact with Wesfarmers LPG.

3. Presentations

3.1 Noise Reports A & B

Lynton Storer, Herring Storer Acoustics

Lynton advised that the study commenced in early 2006 and was completed in 2007. He gave an explanation of the two reports:

Model Update Report A – updated assigned levels (2005 sound power levels, 2006 assigned levels)

(December 2006, editorial revision June 2007)

This report was prepared as an addition to the Kwinana Industries Council (KIC) Cumulative Noise Model (CNM) of the KIA, ref 4756-7-05023 July 2005. The report presents the revised assigned levels, in accordance with the Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997 (the Regulations), as determined for the CNM reference locations, along with an assessment of the KIA cumulative noise level compliance at these locations.

Model Update Report B – updated sound power levels (2006 sound power levels and 2006 assigned levels)

(December 2006, editorial revision June 2007)

This report was prepared as an addition to the Kwinana Industries Council (KIC) Cumulative Noise Model (CNM) of the KIA, ref 4756-7-05023 July 2005. The update includes changes to the sound power levels of Wesfarmers LPG and the inclusion of Fremantle Ports, Kwinana Bulk Terminal (KBT). There have been changes in the regulatory assigned levels, at the CNM reference locations, since the 2005 report, which was addressed in a previous report – ref HAS 5702-4A-05023 December 2006. The updated assigned levels have been used in this assessment.

Lynton reported that the introduction of Fremantle Ports KBT has had negligible impact on the overall predicted noise levels at the receiver locations due to their relatively low noise levels. The reduced sound power level of Wesfarmers LPG has resulted in reduced noise levels at the majority of locations and up to a 2 dB reduction in Medina. This reduction is reflected in Table 2.1 of the report, demonstrating that due to the Wesfarmers LPG noise reduction, the night-time exceedances for worst-case wind conditions has also reduced. It should be noted that the 'exceedances' used in this assessment refer to levels of total industry noise that are above the relevant assigned night levels.

It was noted that the Desalination Plant was not included in the model but will be included in the cumulative update.

The Chair advised that when the model was initially presented there was some scepticism but the NRG took it on to understand the issues. Science is applicable and used cutting edge technology. The model is as reliable as it can be and is backed up by individual industries.

Observer, Steve Hesse, stated he was not confident in the model as he believes there is a problem with noise from industry.

The Chair responded that nobody is denying there is a problem at locations highlighted by Steve Hesse, however this does not invalidate the model.

The Chair suggested that with regards to the monitoring points, ie. Hillman, this could read 'monitoring station 8' for example, and that a statement be included to explain that the suburb name of the monitoring point does not include the whole of the suburb. Lynton agreed to update the report.

The Chair advised that the Terms of Reference for the NRG require that the model be validated, it has to prove science is correct but nothing invalidates community concerns. There are community concerns that the modelling shows a reduction in noise from industry, when they believe in reality that noise levels have not reduced. It was noted that the data is from 2005 and 2006 and the community is concerned about increased noise levels now in 2007.

Cr. Rod Pattinson stated that it had taken a length of time of understand the whole scenario of noise, monitoring, stations, etc and that some NRG members may have had some problems understanding the issues. He believes the information provided is correct and needs to be fully understood by community members so they can explain it to the wider community.

Lynton was asked if the model can be validated with monitoring done at Chalk Hill. He responded that the monitoring carried out did validate the model at that place under the same conditions.

The chair thanked Lynton for his presentation.

3.2 Noise Assessment at Fremantle Ports

Rebecca James explained that the purpose of the presentation was to provide a report on analysis of all previous noise studies undertaken for Fremantle Ports' Kwinana operations and report on recent noise assessment conducted on tug boat operations. The monitoring carried out for tug boards was following feedback of possible concerns from the NRG and the CIF.

Kwinana Bulk Terminal – Normal Operations

- This study assessed noise emissions from KBT during 'normal' operations, selected to be the unloading of white clinker.
- Measurements input to predictive model and compared with night time assigned levels.
- The results show that noise levels from 'normal' operations at the Kwinana Bulk Terminal comply with the assigned noise levels of the *Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997* at all times. They also comply with the requirement to be 5 dB less than the assigned noise level.

Kwinana Bulk Terminal – Pig Iron

- This study assessed noise emissions from KBT during the loading out of pig iron, which was a new task for the Port.
- Measurements input to predictive model and validated against measurements taken at the site boundary. Results shown in following Table.
- The results show that noise levels from pig iron operations at the Kwinana Bulk Terminal comply with the assigned noise levels of the *Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997* at all times. They also comply with the requirement to be 5 dB less than the assigned noise level.

Outer Harbour – Tug Boats

- This study assessed noise emissions from two tugs pulling out a ship, and from a single tug pulling on a bollard to a rating of 55 tonnes.
- Measured tug noise was then positioned at each jetty and the proposed Outer Harbour port development, and the predictive model applied. Results shown in the Table.
- The results show that noise levels from tug boat operations in the Outer Harbour comply with the assigned noise levels of the *Environmental Protection (Noise) Regulations 1997* at all times. They also comply with the requirement to be 5 dB less than the assigned noise level.
- This is consistent with the experience in the Inner Harbour where residential areas are within 200 metres of tug boat operations and no noise complaints relating to tugs have been recorded since the ban on tug “tooting” was introduced.

Summary

- Numerous noise assessments and modelling have been undertaken on Fremantle Ports’ Kwinana operations
- All have demonstrated compliance with applicable legislation
- This is supported by minimal contribution to overall Kwinana Cumulative noise levels
- Further supported by few (if any) validated noise complaints relating to Fremantle Ports’ Kwinana operations
- Recent noise measurement on tug boat operations should provide some assurance that tugs are unlikely to be the source of some alleged “noisy” events

The chair thanked Rebecca for the presentation.

4. Community Update

Peter McKenzie, Town of Kwinana, raised the issue of the amount of time spent at NRG meetings debating the frequency of updating the cumulative noise model. He stated that it was for industry to decide how often this should occur. With regards to the issue of new industries impacting on the current levels, he reminded attendees that new industries can and do access KIC’s model.

5. Dept of Environment & Conservation (DCE) Update

There was no update from the DEC.

6. Industry Update

- Sean Parker, Hlsmelt, advised that after a 4 month extended shutdown, Hlsmelt will be attempting to get the plant back up shortly.
- Genevieve Mannin, CSBP, advised that maintenance would be carried out on the ammonia plant in the next few days and there may be a noticeable flare for a short period.

7. Noise Brochure

Renae Hibben (KIC) tabled the draft Noise Brochure. There has been some input from the DEC and needs further input from members of the NRG. It was acknowledged that the brochure requires further work and it should not be too technical. A more technical brochure could be placed on the KIC website. The Chair reminded attendees that the purpose of the Noise Brochure is not to explain the model, it is to enable the community representatives to provide as a handout to the wider community. Members were asked to provide any final comments by Friday 13 July 2008. Steve Hesse, observer, was

invited to provide input and comments.

8. Any Other Business

There was no further business.

9. Key Messages for Communication

- Presentation made by Herring Storer and Fremantle Ports

10. Date and Time of Next meeting

The date of the next meeting is to be agreed.



ACTION PLAN

Updated 5 July 2007

Ref	Item	Action	By Whom
1.	Assigned noise levels - verification, understanding and methodology.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Declan Morgan to make a presentation at CIF meeting Feb 2006. COMPLETED. • DoE to present at KIC's EPC meeting on 14 February 2006 and provide a one page summary for distribution. COMPLETED. • Lynton Storer working with the Dept of Environment on the agreed assigned levels. • Declan and Tonia to met with Allan Gade and Ann Prince. COMPLETED. • Declan to make presentation at future CIF meeting on results of BarnOwl monitoring at Chalk Hill. COMPLETED. • Noise reports A & B presented by Lynton Storer. COMPLETED. 	
2.	Validation program (monitoring)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposal to be circulated to members for discussion. COMPLETED. • It was agreed to proceed with monitoring at one location. COMPLETED. • Lynton to provide an update on the monitoring program. COMPLETED. • Lynton to provide draft written report. COMPLETED. • Report distributed to members, comments to DH by 28 July 2006. • Members to agree if further monitoring is required. AGREED no further monitoring is required at this stage. 	

3.	Road/rail transport and other noise prevailing issues.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preliminary discussion to be held. COMPLETED. • Roger Dean to draft a letter to the Department of Planning and Infrastructure regarding a whole of Government approach to the issue of transport noise. Draft to be circulated to members for comment. LETTER AGREED AND SENT TO DPI. • Response received from DPI and distributed to members. COMPLETED. 	
4.	Expert advice - Lynton Storer - Dept of Environment - Industry	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advice to be made available as required. ONGOING. 	All
5.	Communications strategy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft Communications Strategy to be presented. COMPLETED & AGREED. • Press release to be prepared. Press release AGREED and DISTRIBUTED. • To be reviewed at next meeting in August 2006. REVIEWED, UPDATED, AGREED. 	TS TS
6.	CIF Feedback	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Update and key messages to be provided at the CIF on 6 December 2005. COMPLETED. • Update and key messages to be provided at the CIF on 7 February 2006. COMPLETED. • CBH to present at the CIF on 6 June 2006. ARG representatives to be in attendance. COMPLETED. • Declan to provide NRG update including results of monitoring at October CIF meeting. COMPLETED. • Chair to provide Key Messages to the CIF on 5 December 2006. COMPLETED. • Chair to provide Key Messages to the CIF on 6 February 2007. INFORMATION HANDOUT DISTRIBUTED. 	RD RD DM RD RD
7.	Local Governments representatives to consider contribution towards the NRG.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In-kind support to be provided. 	LG reps

8.	Collation of industry noise reduction activity since 2001.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Some information has been received. Chris Oughton to collate and present at a future NRG. • Template for future NRG presentations to be established. COMPLETED. • All presentations to be collated and a document developed for reference. ONGOING. 	CO
9.	Noise Brochure	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft produced. • Meeting arranged with DEC noise experts. • Draft to be available for next meeting in May 2007. • Draft tabled at meeting on 5 July. Input requested from members by 13 July 2007. 	TS RH
10.	Noise Education	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attend council meetings to make presentation on the achievements of the NRG and provide an open forum for discussion and education on noise issues. PRESENTATION MADE TO TOWN OF KWINANA. • Event currently being organised with the City of Rockingham. 	